

# SHEFFIELD CITY COUNCIL

## Planning and Highways Committee

### Meeting held 28 January 2020

**PRESENT:** Councillors Peter Rippon (Chair), Jack Clarkson, Tony Damms, Roger Davison, Jayne Dunn, Peter Garbutt, Dianne Hurst, Alan Law, Bob McCann, Zahira Naz, Peter Price, Chris Rosling-Josephs and Andrew Sangar

.....

#### **1. APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

1.1 There were no apologies for absence.

#### **2. EXCLUSION OF PUBLIC AND PRESS**

2.1 No items were identified where resolutions may be moved to exclude the press and public.

#### **3. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

3.1 Councillor Peter Garbutt declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7f, Case No. 18/03109/FUL – Cemetery Road Car Sales, 300 Cemetery Road, Sheffield, S11 8FT, as he had been involved in the early stages of objections to the application. Councillor Garbutt declared that he would not take part in the discussion or voting thereon.

3.2 Councillor Andrew Sangar declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7a, Case No. 18/04773/OUT – Sheffield Health and Social Care, Fulwood House, 5 Old Fulwood Road, Sheffield, S10 3TG and Agenda Item No. 7c, Case No. 19/02632/FUL – 1 Worcester Drive Sheffield, S10 4JG, as a local ward Member. Councillor Sangar declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on either application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

3.3 Councillor Sangar also declared a personal interest in Agenda Item No. 7f, Case No. 18/03109/FUL – Cemetery Road Car Sales, 300 Cemetery Road, Sheffield, S11 8FT, as an Executive Committee Member of an organisation that rents an office in Omega Court, an office block near the application site. Councillor Sangar declared that he had not given an opinion or declared his position on the application prior to the meeting, therefore would take part in the discussion and voting thereon.

**4. MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

- 4.1 The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 14<sup>th</sup> January 2020 were approved as a correct record.

**5. SITE VISIT**

- 5.1 **RESOLVED:** That the Chief Planning Officer, in liaison with a Co-Chair, be authorised to make any arrangements for a site visit, in connection with any planning applications requiring a visit by Members, prior to the next meeting of the Committee.

**6. APPLICATIONS UNDER VARIOUS ACTS/REGULATIONS**

**7. APPLICATION NO. 18/04773/OUT - SHEFFIELD HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE, FULWOOD HOUSE, 5 OLD FULWOOD ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S10 3TG**

- 6a.1 Details of an amended condition was included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.
- 6a.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and key issues set out in the report.
- 6a.3 Councillor Cliff Woodcraft attended the meeting and spoke against the application.
- 6a.4 Mr. Michael Edgar (agent for the applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.
- 6a.5 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, including the amended condition, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations, as summarised in the report and the supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.
- 6a.6 **RESOLVED:** That (1) Condition 28 be amended to include assessment of pedestrian routes through to Hangingwater Road to the South East of the site; and (2) an application for outline planning permission (all matters reserved) be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted and including the amended condition, for residential development including the demolition of existing buildings at Sheffield Health and Social Care, Fulwood House, 5 Old Fulwood Road, Sheffield, S10 3TG (Case No. 18/04773/OUT).

**8. APPLICATION NO. 19/03779/FUL - LAND BOUNDED BY ROCKINGHAM STREET, WELLINGTON STREET AND TRAFALGAR STREET, WELLINGTON STREET, SHEFFIELD S1 4ED**

- 6b.1 Amended conditions, details regarding affordable housing (including amended heads of terms for a legal agreement) and additional representations, along with Officer responses, were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.
- 6b.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.
- 6b.3 Mr. Brian Holmshaw attended the meeting and spoke against the application.
- 6b.4 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, including the amended conditions, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations, as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.
- 6b.5 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally and including the amended conditions, subject to the completion of a legal agreement pursuant to the amended heads of terms to secure affordable housing, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for the demolition of existing buildings and erection of mixed use 38/17/12-storey building comprising 1230 residential units with ancillary amenities including gymnasium, cinema, common rooms and raised external deck, associated cycle and bin storage and ground floor retail unit (Use Class A1) (Development Accompanied by Environmental Statement as amended 19<sup>th</sup> December 2019) (Amended Description), at land bounded by Rockingham Street and Wellington Street and Trafalgar Street, Wellington Street, Sheffield, S1 4ED (Case No. 19/03779/FUL).

**9. APPLICATION NO. 19/02632/FUL - 1 WORCESTER DRIVE, SHEFFIELD, S10 4JG**

- 6c.1 Additional representations, along with the Officer response, and an amended condition were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.
- 6c.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.
- 6c.3 Councillor Cliff Woodcraft, Mr. Dinesh Fernando and Mr. Peter Cooper attended the meeting and spoke against the application.
- 6c.4 Mr. Andrew Tingle (agent for the applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.
- 6c.5 The Committee considered the report and the proposed conditions, including the amended condition, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning

Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and the supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

- 6c.6 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, and including the amended condition, for the reasons set out in the report, now submitted, for the demolition of dwellinghouse and garage and erection of 1 x 2/3 storey block with single storey offshoots comprising of 5 apartments, provision of off-street car parking accommodation and new vehicular access from Worcester Drive, at 1 Worcester Drive, Sheffield, S10 4JG (Case No. 19/02632/FUL).

**10. APPLICATION NO. 19/01899/FUL - 24 SCHOLES RISE, SHEFFIELD, S35 9UQ**

6d.1 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

6d.2 Mr. Michael Kubon attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

6d.3 Mr James Catlyn (applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

6d.4 The Committee considered the report and the proposed conditions, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

6d.5 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for demolition of rear off-shot, erection of one/two storey side and single storey rear extensions to dwellinghouse and removal of rear patio door and replacement with a window, at 24 Scholes Rise, Sheffield, S35 9UQ, (Case No. 19/01899/FUL).

**11. APPLICATION NO. 19/01274/FUL - LAND OPPOSITE THE GRIFFS, BETWEEN RIGGS LOW ROAD AND RIGGS HIGH ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S6 6GB**

6e.1 Additional representations, along with the Officer response, and an amended condition were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

6e.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

6e.3 Ms Amanda Atkin, Ms Kath MacKay and Ms Lynette Jackson (Loxley Valley Protection Society) attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

6e.4 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, including the amended condition, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report

and supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

- 6e.5 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, and including the amended condition, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for use of agricultural land as a woodland/natural burial ground, including laying out of parking area off Riggs High Road (Additional Information Submitted) at Land opposite The Griffs, Between Riggs Low Road and Riggs High Road, Sheffield, S6 6GB (Case No. 19/01274/FUL).

**12. APPLICATION NO. 18/03109/FUL - CEMETERY ROAD CAR SALES, 300 CEMETERY ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S11 8FT**

6f.1 Additional representations, along with the Officer response, a report correction and amended conditions were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

6f.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

6f.3 Ms Sharon Watson and Ms Sarah Blackwell attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

6f.4 Mr. Steve Burlaga (applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

6f.5 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, including the amended conditions, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made at the meeting.

6f.6 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally, and including the amended conditions for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for demolition of garage/office buildings and erection of 11 apartments and 3 duplex apartments in a 4 storey block including ground floor car parking (amended plans and description), at Cemetery Road Car Sales, 300 Cemetery Road, Sheffield, S11 8FT (Case No. 18/03109/FUL).

**13. APPLICATION NO. 18/02802/FUL - TUDOR GATES, UNIT 1, PARKERS YARD, STANNINGTON ROAD, SHEFFIELD, S6 5FL**

6g.1 A deleted condition and additional representations, along with the Officer response, were included within the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

6g.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

6g.3 Ms Leonie Wood (Loxley Valley Protection Society) and Ms Lynette Jackson attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

6g.4 Mr. David Sweeting (agent for the applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

6g.5 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as summarised in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

6g.6 **RESOLVED:** That (1) the heads of terms of the legal agreement be reconsidered with the applicant, the Council's Parks and countryside Department and Sport England to look at the possibility of requiring some or all of the contribution towards new/replacement sports facilities to be spent on facilities in the locality of Deer Park high rise flats; the final wording of such obligation(s) to be approved by the Co-Chairs of the Planning and Highways Committee, and;

(2) an application for planning permission be GRANTED, conditionally and subject to the legal agreement to secure a sum towards new/replacement sports facilities, as well as obligations relating to the re-use of the cricket ground, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for demolition of existing buildings and erection of a Class A1 retail foodstore including car parking, access, landscaping, ball stop netting and supporting structures and sportsfield parking facility (amended plans and description), at Tudor Gates, Unit 1, Parkers Yard, Stannington Road, Sheffield, S6 5FL (Case No. 18/02802/FUL).

**14. APPLICATION NO. 19/00037/FUL - LAND AT JUNCTION WITH HERRIES ROAD, HERRIES ROAD SOUTH AND PENISTONE ROAD NORTH, SHEFFIELD, S6 1QA**

6h.1 Additional representations, along with the Officer response, were included in the Supplementary Report circulated and summarised at the meeting.

6h.2 The Officer presented the report which gave details of the application and highlighted the history of the site and the key issues set out in the report.

6h.3 Mr. Andrew Malley (representing Fox Valley) and Mr. Brad Wiseman (representing Hillsborough Exchange) attended the meeting and spoke against the application.

6h.4 Ms. Lydia Sadler and Mr. Patrick Herbert (both acting on behalf of the applicant) attended the meeting and spoke in support of the application.

6h.5 The Committee considered the report and proposed conditions, having regard to the development plan, the National Planning Policy Framework and other relevant considerations as outlined in the report and supplementary report, now submitted, and also having regard to representations made during the meeting.

6h.6 **RESOLVED:** That an application for planning permission be GRANTED,

conditionally, for the reasons set out in the report now submitted, for erection of 3 retail units (Class A1), 8 storage and distribution units (Class B8), 2 drive thru restaurants (Class A3/A5), 1 vehicle maintenance and repair unit (Class B2) and 2 substations including provision of car parking, junction improvements to Penistone Road and Herries Road, access on to Herries Road/Herries Road South, servicing, landscaping, pedestrian access and associated on and off-site works (as amended), at land at junction with Herries Road, Herries Road South and Penistone Road North, Sheffield, S6 1QA (Case No. 19/00037/FUL).

**15. RECORD OF PLANNING APPEAL SUBMISSIONS AND DECISIONS**

- 7.1 The Committee received and noted a report of the Chief Planning Officer detailing new planning appeals received and planning appeals dismissed by the Secretary of State.

**16. DATE OF NEXT MEETING**

- 8.1 It was noted that the next meeting of the Committee would be held at 2.00pm on Tuesday 18<sup>th</sup> February 2020 at the Town Hall, Sheffield.